

No.F.1(18)/DD-II/PPRA/2010
GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN
PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY
(CABINET DIVISION)

<><><>

Islamabad, the February 15, 2010.

From : Naeem Ahmed,
Deputy Director – II,

To : Syed Adil Gilani,
Chairman,
Transparency International-Pakistan,
5-C, 2nd Floor,
Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase-VII,
Defence Housing Authority,
Karachi.

Subject: **VIOLATION OF PUBLIC PROCUREMENT RULES 2004 NIC
PROCUREMENT 100 – 200 ACRES PLOT FOR HOUSING
SOCIETY.**

Please refer to Transparency International-Pakistan's letter No. nil,
dated 28th January and 4th February, 2010 on the above subject.

2. Your complaint was forwarded to National Insurance Company Limited
for disposal under Rule-48 of Public Procurement Rules, 2004. Procuring Agency
has given the comments on the complaint and the same is being enclosed for your
kind perusal.

(NAEEM AHMED)



13

NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY LIMITED
(OWNED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN)

Ref: Bldg/36(29)/PPRA/2010

Naem Ahmed
Deputy Director-II
Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
Cabinet Division, Government of Pakistan
Islamabad

Karachi, 10th February 2010

**Re: Comprehensive Report and Comments on the Complaint filed by
Transparency International Pakistan dated: 28th January 2010**

Further to your Letter No: F.I(118)/DD-II/PPRA/2010 dated: 29th January 2010, addressed to the Chairman, NICL, please find attached herewith comprehensive report and comments on behalf of the National Insurance Company Limited.

Dy. No. 150... CO. II/PPRA/2010
Date: 16.2.10


(Muhammad Zahoor)
Executive Director (F&IT)

C.C alongwith relevant Report to:

1. Chairman Public Accounts Committee, National Assembly, Islamabad.
2. Auditor General Pakistan, Islamabad.
3. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad.
4. Registrar Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.
5. Managing Director, PPRA, Islamabad.
6. Syed Adil Gilani, Chairman Transparency International-Pakistan.



NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY LIMITED
(OWNED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN)

**Procurement of 100-200 Acres Land for Housing Society and 4000-10000 sq yards
Plots both in Karachi-Lahore for Commercial Development**

COMPREHENSIVE REPORT & COMMENTS

Item-wise Reply to the allegations leveled by Transparency International Pakistan ("TIP") vide letter dated: 28th January 2010 is set out hereinafter: -

1. Evaluation Criteria

The allegation leveled by TIP to the effect that the Evaluation Criteria was tailor made by NICL to suit a particular bidder, is grossly incorrect and without any bases, at all. It is averred that the detailed Evaluation Criteria was made available at NICL's Real Estate Department for any interested party to inspect and collect a copy thereof. Notice to the public at large was also issued to this effect vide Corrigendum, dated 16.12.2009. Further averred that despite the aforesaid, none of the interested parties approached NICL, either to inspect or collect the Evaluation Criteria. It is also pertinent to state that the Evaluation Criteria was also posted on PPRA website, where it could be viewed and downloaded by any interested party.

As far as the allocation of scores for 7 sub-categories is concerned, it is averred that the total score of 100 was distributed amongst the 7 sub-categories and this allocation and minimum passing score was very clearly set out in the Evaluation Criteria.

2. Quantum of Land

NICL advertised for procurement of 100-200 acres of land for setting up housing colony. In Pakistan, as per well settled custom, one acre is deemed to be comprised of 8 kanals of land. Since the land situated in Mouza Toor Warraich, Off Ferozpur Road, Lahore is 803 Kanals, hence the total land is equivalent to slightly more than 100 Acres. In the premise, the allegation leveled by TIP is baseless and without any rationale.

3. Price of Land

The price of the Land has not been assessed by the Chairman, Members of the NICL Board or any of its employees. The precise quantum of price is estimated by qualified assessors/valuers. Two assessors/valuers were carefully selected from the panel duly approved by the Pakistan Banks Association, and assigned the task of assessing the



15

NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY LIMITED
(OWNED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN)

quantum of price of the land. Detailed reports qua the assessments were submitted by both the assessors whereupon the Board of Directors of NICL finalized the price of the land after due deliberations.

4. Violation of PPRA Rules, 2004

NICL has neither restricted nor put any unusual or complicated condition either in favor of or against any single party. NICL, through concrete measures adopted in the course of the entire procurement process, has ensured widest possible and transparent competition. In the premise, no violation of PPRA Rules No. 10, 32 or at all has been committed.

I fervently hope that the comments offered by NICL in the terms set out hereinbefore would adequately clarify any ambiguity qua the transparent procurement of the land by NICL.

Best regards,

Muhammad Zahoor
Executive Director (F&IT)