



No.P&D 1303-07

**DIRECTORATE GENERAL**  
**AGRICULTURAL ENGINEERING, DEPARTMENT**  
**BALUCHISTAN, QUETTA.**

Dated Quetta, the, 7/7, 2017.

To,

**The Secretary,**  
Agriculture and Cooperatives Department,  
Government of Balochistan, Quetta

Subject:- **ENQUIRY NO.674 DATED 05-05-2017 FOR PROCUREMENT OF 29 TRACK TYPE TRACTORS(BULLDOZERS).**

Reference Chief Secretary Balochistan's Office UO. No.PS/CS/Misc:/98-vol-XIV/1869 dated 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2017 on the subject cited above.

Please find enclosed herewith para wise replies of observations raised by M/S Multiline Enterprises , Lahore for information and further necessary .

**DIRECTOR GENERAL,**  
Agricultural Engineering Department,  
Balochistan, Quetta.

1. The Director General, NAB, Balochistan, Quetta with reference to the NAB Balochistan letter No.5034/A&P/6/NAB(B)/2017/270 dated 22-6-2017
2. The Managing Director, BPRA, Quetta
3. The Chairman, Transparency International, Karachi
4. M/S Multiline Enterprises, 64-Ahmed Block New Garden Town, Lahore Pakistan in continuation of this Directorate General letter No.8020 dated 22-6-17.

**DIRECTOR GENERAL,**  
Agricultural Engineering Department,  
Balochistan, Quetta.

<p><b>Observation</b></p> <p>the tender was advertised on 05-05-2017 in the National Press, subsequently we had requested through our letter dated 11-05-2017 for the purchase of bidding documents but we have just received the bidding documents on 12-06-2017 with opening date of 22-06-2017 which is not at all justified</p>	<p><b>Reply</b></p> <p>The NIT (Notice Inviting Tender) alongwith bidding documents was uploaded on bppra.gov.pk website on 5-5-2017 vide TS125647E and published in leading newspaper Dawn, Express Tribune and Jang on 6-5-2017. The Bids were to be opened on 22-6-2017. Sufficient time was available for Bid preparation. However, due to delayed dispatch of Bidding Document, the date of Bid opening has been extended up to 17th July, 2017.</p>
<p>Your specifications require engine model Komatsu, Caterpillar, New Holland (FIAT), John Deere and Case, this requirement is completely biased, as we have serious Reservations because CNH (Case New Holland) is one manufacturer and they use FPT as their engine, so your reference to 2 of their brands is not justified. Furthermore, one of the biggest manufacturers of engine worldwide Cummins has been missed out, this is not understandable.</p> <p>Also required engine Stage III A Compliances, as per our understanding in Pakistan the availability of fuel in Province of Balochistan it is not justified, Stage-II has to be allowed in order to be compliant for the local fuel availability.</p>	<p>As per BPPRA Rules-2014 use of brand name shall be qualified with the words —or equivalent. Cummins engine comes under the umbrella word of equivalent.</p> <p>The department has procured 71 caterpillar D6k2 bulldozers stage-III compliances. The bulldozers has worked 175,000 hours and no premature defects observed in engine. Stage-IIIa compliances are friendlier for environment as compared to Stage-II. However, the Stage -II is also qualified and friendlier for environment up to some extent. In this regard a Corrigendum has been issued for adding stage-II in engine specification for wide competition.</p>
<p>Make of Undercarriage:</p> <p>Undercarriage is also limited to CAT, Komatsu, John Deere, as per our understanding these are not undercarriage manufacturers, while BERCO and FTM are manufacturers for undercarriage, while our manufacturer Shantui is also one of the leading undercarriage manufacturers in the World. So, your specifications are complete violation of Rule 4 and</p>	<p>As per BPPRA Rules-2014 use of brand name shall be qualified with the words —or equivalent. Shantui undercarriage is equivalent to the brand name mentioned in the Bidding Document. Shantui comes under the umbrella word of equivalent.</p>

Observation	Reply
<p>j) Evaluation Criteria:</p> <p>a. As per your evaluation criteria(a), you have mentioned recognized / tested make while requiring certificate from OEM, please clarify what type of certification is required.</p> <p>b. Undercarriage is required from a recognized tested make, please clarify whether undercarriage is being used in Pakistan for the last more than 15 years would be acceptable.</p> <p>c. As per evaluation criteria no. 2, the marks allocated is also not fully justified, keeping in view the total sales of bulldozers in Pakistan.</p> <p>d. As per evaluation criteria no. 3, own network of workshop countrywide is also not justified because if any supplier who undertakes to provide after sale in Balochistan should not be discriminated</p> <p>e. As per evaluation criteria no. 4, years of appointment as local authorized dealer, the maximum mark being given for more than 20 years to a bidder has no basis on the technical capability of the machine / bulldozers, normally 10 years dealership experience is considered to be more than sufficient.</p> <p>f. As per the Annexure-II, bid evaluation criteria financial, this criteria is highly objectionable because no</p>	<p>a. An Original Equipment Manufacturer (OEM) is a company that produces parts and equipment that may be marketed by another manufacturer. OEM certificate is required from manufacturer. OEM is a certificate among consider an international to genuine product of a firm. It is among the incremental best practices for genuine products from their manufacturer</p> <p>b. The under carriage is acceptable to the procuring agencies if the undercarriage has no customer complaints regarding the product. Setting up the Evaluation Criteria that ensure preference to experienced firm is the obligation of procuring agency.</p> <p>c. Setting up of Evaluation Criteria that ensures after sale services, spare parts availability and workmanship is a mandatory requirement to be met by the procuring agency</p> <p>d. <u>Commitment of establishing workshop</u> will not be treated equal to the already established workshops and after sale facility.</p> <p>e. Length/Duration of service is one of the indicators of professionally sound firms/products. Moreover, determination of level of experience is prerogative of procuring agency.</p> <p>f. Horse power and blade dimensions are known factors of established manufacturer products and are</p>