



GEOTECH CONSULTANTS

CONSULTANTS AND MANAGEMENT ENGINEERS

Since 1976

Transportation | Civil | Geotechnical | Structural | Pavement |
Environment | Materials

Ref: GEO/KSEW/COR.0614.10.SH

June 14, 2010

Page 1 of 2

To,
Capt. Shakil Naz
Project Director (Ship Lift and Transfer System)
West Wharf Dockyard Road,
Karachi, Pakistan.

Subject: Disqualification of Geotech Consultants with no technical explanation

Dear Sir,

With reference to your email dated June 11, 2010 (received at 16:04); this is to request itemized explanation for the disqualification of Geotech Consultants' technical proposal by your consultant for the "soil investigation for marine civil works for ship-lift and transfer system at Karachi Shipyard and Engineering Works." As one of the oldest geotechnical firm in Pakistan, we are shocked at the low level of technical and engineering knowledge that you and/or your consultant for the subject project have displayed towards the disqualification.

We believe that you have entirely depended on your consultant's ability to scrutinize the tender documents. Based on our more than three (3) decades of vast engineering background and a history of never being disqualified, we are forced to doubt whether KSEW personnel and their hired consultant on the above mentioned project are qualified and above all competent enough to successfully complete tender documents screening i.e. prequalification/post-qualification of firms. In the absence of itemized evaluation procedure, as was also identified in our cover letter for the technical proposal and in accordance with Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) rules, we request that your consultant must provide itemized explanation for their justification of our disqualification. It further states that "failure to provide for an unambiguous evaluation criteria in the bidding documents shall amount to mis-procurement". Based on our geotechnical work experience it is our challenge that no one can disqualify us and that here are only a handful technically sound geotechnical firms. Being among the few and the most accomplished is one reason several geotechnical firms have been established here in the past with a similar name as Geotech's.

As mentioned in the supplied forms titled as (1) Details of seven contracts of similar nature/complexity (Form A-5), (2) Nine current/most recent contract commitments ranging from Rs. 0.1million to Rs. 68million (Form A-6), (3) Personnel capabilities (Form A-7) and in addition the list of summarized similar works successfully performed by Geotech Consultants alone are sufficient to support technical capabilities of the firm. You have totally neglected to study our introduction and history of offshore geotechnical investigations provided with the aforementioned tender document. Most importantly, a total disregard of recent similar work performed at Karachi Shipyard & Engineering Works, for MACE Group, London, U.K, and for Gwadar Development Authority further proves our assertion of KSEW personnel's or the consultant's incompetence. Copies of table contents (TOC) page from past geotechnical investigation report, example bore logs, CPT logs from past projects illustrating the last 35 years of work history, and especially job experience of working together with Norconsult-Norway during the construction of the Karachi Fish Harbor (KFHA) were provided in support of tender documents. It clearly shows that the person(s) responsible for scrutinizing the submitted tender documents have no or limited knowledge of geotechnical companies in Pakistan who are capable of successfully performing the tasks outlined in the tender

This document shall not be reproduced, except in full, without written approval of Geotech Consultants

Over 30 Years of Dedication in Geotechnical Engineering and Geo-Environmental Services

Head Office: A-214, Block A, KDA Officer Society, Karachi-75260, Pakistan

☎: +92 (021) 34972918 ■ 📠: +92 (021) 34985333 ■ ✉: info@geotechconsult.com ■ 🌐: http://www.geotechconsult.com



GEOTECH CONSULTANTS

CONSULTANTS AND MANAGEMENT ENGINEERS

Since 1976

Transportation | Civil | Geotechnical | Structural | Pavement |
Environment | Materials

documents. We, Geotech Consultants, are one of very few companies in Pakistan who have the in-house capabilities for such projects. Furthermore, Geotech has the work-force comprising more geotechnical engineers than most large companies. Geotech Consultants have a clean history of over 30 years of professional experience. As identified in the tender documents under "Bidding Data" section no. 16.4 titled as "Responsiveness of Bids" we fulfilled all items i through vi (specially the items iii to v, which are the most important).

To further prove the preposterous nature of the disqualification decision, it must be mentioned here that our past geotechnical project at KSEW was completed successfully. Note that in the office of DGM KSEW and in my presence, the same consultant had even praised our technical ability to provide satisfactory responses to all geotechnical queries.

Your consultant's lack of geotechnical engineering knowledge is also proved by the suggestion to conduct "soil investigation and sampling by Auger boring" method (ASTM D1452) as identified in Addendum No. 1. This method of boring destroys soil and rock stratification and gets the sample mixed with water below the water table. However, it is possible but it may not be the most efficient method for the aforementioned project as was also identified in our technical proposal.

At this stage, regardless of the outcome of the financial proposal review, we consider the matter of disqualification of our firm of great seriousness and urgency, and you are kindly requested to provide itemized explanation for the basis of your decision. As per PPRA rules and regulations you are bound to provide us proper itemized evaluation criteria and related explanation and list of qualified/disqualified bidders on KSEW letter head (not through personal email) and to stop all further proceedings related to the project evaluation and award procedure.

We take the matter of our firm's disqualification extremely seriously, as it affects our professional reputation, if deemed necessary, we will explore any form of legal assistance or other avenues to either get a satisfactory explanation or a statement of apology for falsely disqualifying Geotech based on lack of proper knowledge to scrutinize tender documents. In the absence of or failure to provide a timely satisfactory response we shall then be forced to assume involvement of negative intentions towards our technical disqualification by your consultant.

Please feel free to contact us at (021) 34972918 to discuss this matter.

Most sincerely,

For Geotech Consultants
M. Iqbal Siddiqui
(Manager Technical)