



28th December, 2015

TL15/2812/16A

Managing Director,
Karachi Water & Sewerage Board,
Karachi.

Sub: K-IV Project, Minutes of Meeting of SPPRA dated 18th December, 2015.

Dear Sir,

This is with regard to the tender for "Supply and Fixing of Boundary Pillars and Walls" of KW&SB, the Minutes of Meeting held at SPPRA on 9th October, 2015, are referred to - (Annexure A)

The Managing Director is requested to kindly take action in accordance with the decisions taken by SPPRA vide page No. 9 of the Minutes of Meeting.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption.

With Regards,


Syed Adil Gillani
Advisor

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Chief Minister, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
2. Chief Justice, Sindh High Court, Karachi
3. Director General, NAB, Karachi.
4. Chief Secretary, Government of Sindh, Karachi.
5. Managing Director, SPPRA, Karachi.



No. DD(E-II)K-375(KWSB)/14-15/SPPRA/8967
GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
SINDH PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY
AUTHORITY

Karachi dated 18th December, 2015

Subject: MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON 9th OCT, 2015 REGARDING K-VI PROJECT OF KW&SB

In continuation of meetings held on 30th June, 2015 and 17th September, 2015 another meeting was held under the Chairmanship of Mr. Adil Gilani, Advisor, Transparency International Pakistan on Friday 9th October, 2015 in SPPRA office to discuss the observations raised by TIP on the subject procurement. Following attended the meeting;

- i. Mr. Adil Gilani, Advisor, TIP, Karachi (In Chair)
- ii. Mr. Saleem Siddiqui, Project Director, K-IV Project, KW&SB.
- iii. Lt. Col.(R) Ajmal Rasheed, Executive Director, Osmani & Co.
- iv. Mr. Moin Ahmed, Deputy Project Director, K-IV Project, KW&SB.
- v. Mr. Qaiser Ali, Program Manager, K-VI Project, KW&SB, Karachi.
- vi. Mr. Abdul Rahim Soomro, Managing Director, SPPRA
- vii. Mr. Mohammad Ayub Ali Khan, Deputy Director, SPPRA

2. The Chair welcomed the participants. Project Director, K-IV Project informed that as per decision taken in the meeting dated 30th June 2015 the Evaluation Report has been signed / verified by the Consulting Firm i.e. M/s Osmani & Company.

3. Mr. Salim, Project Director pointed out that the Procuring Agency considered the instant procurement as "Goods" and adopted Single Stage-Two Envelopes method of Procurement which is applicable for procurement of "Goods" whereas; Bidding Documents for procurement of "Works" were issued by the PA.

4. Project Director along with Lt. Col. (R) Ajmal Rasheed made detailed clarification and viewed that only Standard Bidding Document for Procurement of "Works" duly approved by the Authority (SPPRA) are available on SPPRA website whereas; documents for Procurement of "Goods" duly approved by the Authority is not available till to date. However, with the expertise of decades, consultants customized the documents to suit the best need for the procurement of "Goods", as far as possible, however some typographical errors may have been left. Therefore; the best efforts on behalf of the client and consultants were exercised to follow SPP Rules as humanly possible.

5. Project Director, K-IV, KW&SB stated that as per minutes of the meeting held on 30th June 2015 with Mr. Adil Gilani of TIP it was decided that "*M/s Osmani & Co. shall re-evaluate the reports prepared by the Procurement Committee of the Procuring Agency and submit to the SPPRA and if found satisfactory, KW&SB may move forward and award the work hence, Transparency International Pakistan shall have no objection*". He explained that in

compliance of the decision and on the directions of the Project Director, the evaluation was again carried out by the Consulting firm i.e. M/s Osmani & Co. and Lt. Col. (R) Ajmal Rasheed, Executive Director of the firm has certified that there was no change in the evaluation report as prepared by the Procurement Committee of the Procuring Agency and all codal formalities were followed. The duly verified report by the Consulting Firm was submitted to SPPRA vide letter dated 6th August 2015.

6. He further explained that a Corrigendum of the previous decision of the meeting was received vide letter dated 24th July 2014 in which following decision is mentioned, which was neither stated nor discussed nor agreed in the meeting hence; contained no legal binding;

“it was unanimously decided that M/s Osmani & Co (Consultant) should re-evaluate the reports prepared by the Procurement Committee of the Procuring Agency (KW&SB) and based on the Evaluation report, another meeting will be held to decide the issue raised by Transparency International Pakistan (TIP)”

7. He also informed that Project Director / Procurement Committee K-IV had requested SPPRA for withdrawal of this Corrigendum vide letter dated 4th August 2015 as the decision mentioned in it is not as it was decided in the meeting. Mr. Siddiqui, also informed that all codal formalities have been completed / observed during the procurement process.

8. The Project Director stated that this project is of very important nature for which after long process land of 13,350 Acres has been obtained from Board of Revenue and both Federal and Provincial Governments have passed strict directives to complete the K-IV Project well in time in the public interest. He further stated that work has already been started, therefore, proposal of TIP observer for re-invitation of tender is not practical and feasible.

9. Mr. Adil Gilani, TIP observer said that the minutes of previous meeting issued were wrong therefore, Corrigendum was issued. Mr. Gilani also did not agree on the evaluation report prepared by the PA / Consulting Firm and said that Evaluation of bids is not done as per criteria mentioned in the Bidding Documents therefore, the tender shall be discharged and re-invited.

10. The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from the Chair.


Deputy Director (A&F)

Copy to;

1. Mr. Adil Gilani, Advisor, TIP, Karachi.
2. Mr. Salim Siddiqi, Project Director, K-IV Project KW&SB.
3. Lt. Col.(R) Ajmal Rasheed, Executive Director, Osmani & Co.
4. P.S. to Managing Director, SPPRA.