



TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL-PAKISTAN

5-C, 2nd Floor, Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase VII,
Defence Housing Authority, Karachi.
Tel: (92-21)-35390408, 35390409, Fax: 35390410
E-mail: ti.pakistan@gmail.com
Website: www.transparency.org.pk

17th December, 2014

Mr. Muneer Kamal,
Chairman,
National Bank of Pakistan,
Karachi.

Sub: Complaint against Award of Contract Inaccurate Product at 30% Higher Price Resulting in Approx. Loss of 12 Million to NBP for Tender ID: NBP/ LSS& EG/ Slip Printers/ 23072014.

Dear Sir,

Transparency International Pakistan has received a complaint from M/s ABM Data Systems (Private) Ltd. The complaint is enclosed for your ready reference.

The complainant alleges that;

1. They participated in the above mentioned tender by offering Epson slip printer as per specification in published in tender ID. Whereas Tender ID: NBP/ LSS& EG/ Slip Printers/ 23072014.
2. In tender documents NBP did not clearly indicate that they required standard impact printer, instead of their tender ID clearly indicate of slip printers.
3. The procuring agency, National Bank of Pakistan, finalized standard impact printer in place of Slip printer at higher price instead of Slip printer as per required by the NBP.
4. NBP uploaded contract evaluation report on 7th November, 2014 and declared standard impact printer successful without evaluation of technical restrictions.

Transparency International Pakistan requests Chairman to kindly examine the complaint and if the complaint is genuine take action, so that the loss is not incurred.

Transparency International Pakistan is striving for across the board application of Rule of Law, which is the only way to stop corruption.

With Regards,

Sohail Muzaffar
Chairman

Copies forwarded for the information with request to take action under their mandate to:

1. Secretary to Prime Minister, Islamabad.
2. Mr. Khurshid Shah, Leader of Opposition & Chairman, PAC, National Assembly, Islamabad.
3. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad.
4. Director General, NAB Sindh, Karachi.
5. Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.
6. Managing Director, PPRA, Islamabad.

To,
The Managing Director.
Public Procurement Regulatory Authority,
1st, Floor FBC Building Near State Bank,
Sector G-5/2, Islamabad-Pakistan.

Date: 17th, November 2014

Ref: Tender ID: NBP/LSS&EG/Slip Printers / 23072014
PPRA Ref: No. (TSE): TS216681E

Sub: Complaint against award of contract Inaccurate product at 30% higher price resulting approx. loss of Rs. 12million to NBP

Dear Sir / Madam,

With reference to above reference tender, we would like to draw your kind intervene into this matter to provide justice & restraint NBP for procurement of inaccurate product at higher price.

EPSON slip & standard Impact printers are worldwide recognized as premium brand of slip & standard impact printers; whereas local or international market known and preferable brand.

We participated into above reference tender by offering Epson slip printer as per specification published in tender. Whereas tender ID: **NBP/LSS&EG/Slip Printers / 23072014**

Procurement agency (NBP) finalize standard impact printer in place of Slip printer at higher price, Instead of Slip printer as per required by NBP

Following are our grievances against NBP decision.

1. At tender documents procurement agency did not clearly indicate that they required standard impact printer, instead of their tender ID clearly indicate of slip printers.

2. During pre-bid process procurement agency clearly inform to the potential bidder that they should quote single product only. (copy of e-mail attached)
3. We submit our bid with Epson Slip printer TM-U295 which is specialized slip printer and NBP is already using same slip printer since 2012.
4. However, it is very shocking for us to know that procurement agency finalize standard impact printer in place of slip printer.
5. WE would like to inform you that we raise our objection regarding technical difference between slip printer & standard impact printer in our various letters dated 03/10/2014 & 16/10/2014 & 13/11/2014 (copy attached).
6. Despite of our various letters, till now we didn't received any response from NBP to give us fair opportunity for further clarify our point of view.
7. Instead of giving us fair opportunity to examine our grievances NBP upload contract evaluation report on 7th, November 2014 declare standard impact printer successful without evaluation of technical restrictions.
8. If NBP required both standard impact printer / slip printer then they should inform clearly in tender documents and allow bidder to submit their proposal with both category products instead of restricting them for single option.
9. By restricting for single products submission NBP deny us & other bidder to give opportunity to submit standard impact printer proposal along with slip printer so NBP can easily evaluate both category products prices before finalization of contract.

Due to this ambiguity / inaccurate product finalization NBP will bear the loss of approximately Rs. 12 million or 30% of contract value if they purchase standard impact printer by comparing price with slip printer into above tender.

We request you to kindly look to this matter and restraint NBP from any unfair act of favoritism.

Regards,

Muhammad Ahmer

Sr. Manager Sales (South & Lahore) mahmer@abmds.net | Cell: +92-300-8239397 |

ABM Data System Private Limited | www.abmds.net | PABX: +92-21-111-147-147 Ext: 141 | Fax: +92-21-35681361 |

ABM Terrace, Safety pride. CL-7/18/16, Opp. F.G. Public School, Dr. Daud Pota Road, Karachi-Pakistan.

C.c:

Deputy Director-Legal PPRA

Transparency International Pakistan.

SEVP LSS&EG. NBP



To,
Senior Vice President,
Logistics Support, Security &
Engineering Group,
3rd Floor, NBP Head Office,
Karachi.

Date: 03/10/2014

Reference: Financial opening dated 2nd, October, 2014 Tender No. NBP/LSS&EG/SLIP Printers/23072014

Subject : Complain against technical assessment

Respected Sir,

With reference to the above, we would like to draw your kind attention in above matter.

1. ABM Data Systems (Pvt) Ltd, participated in caption tender as per National bank of Pakistan requirement (SLIP printer), we submit our proposal for EPSON TM-U295 which is specific SLIP printer.
2. We surprise to know that procurement agency qualify technical proposal of M/s: Rayyanco they quote wrong product (OKI ML1120) which is draft printer and it is entirely different product which is not fulfill NBP desire requirement.

We request you kindly review technical proposal again & give us opportunity to clarify any point and also give us any suitable time for meeting.

Regards,

Muhammad Ahmer
Sr. Manager Sales (South & Lahore)

mahmer@abmds.net | Cell: +92-300-8239397 |  ABM Data System Private Limited | www.abmds.net

CC to:
CIO National Bank of Pakistan Ltd.





To,
Senior Vice President,
Logistics Support, Security &
Engineering Group,
3rd Floor, NBP Head Office,
Karachi.



Date: 16/10/2014

Reference: Tender No. NBP/LSS&EG/SLIP Printers/23072014

Subject : Complain against technical assessment

Respected Sir,

With reference to caption tender, we submitted our letter on 3rd Oct, 2014 (copy enclosed) with some concerns in technical evaluation, we are still waiting for your response and also give us any suitable time for meeting.

Regards,
Muhammad Ahmer
Sr. Manager Sales (South & Lahore)

mahmer@abmds.net | Cell: +92-300-8239397 | **ABM** Data System Private Limited | www.abmds.net

CC to:
CIO National Bank of Pakistan Ltd.



ata Systems (Private) Ltd.
(Incorporated Since 1983)



Date 13/11/2014

To,
Senior Vice President / Divisional Head
Logistic Support, Security & Engineering Group
National Bank of Pakistan
3rd, Floor, NBP Head Office.
Karachi.

Reference : Evaluation report Tender ID : NBP /LSS&EG/Slip Printers / 23072014
PPRA Ref. No. : TS216681E
Subject : Complain against award of contract INACCURATE PRODUCTS AT APPROX 30% VERY HIGHER PRICE.

Respected Sir,

With reference to the above, we would like to draw your kind attention in above matter to secure NBP for awarding contract to inaccurate products at very higher price.

1. The tender launch with above subject reference clearly stated Slip printers, however tender announcement "Procurement of Slip / Impact printers" create some confusion. As per our best understanding NBP requires slip printers instead of standard impact printers
2. We would like to draw your attention that there is a difference between slip printers & standard impact printers which we clarify in our various letters dated 03/10/2014 & 10/11/2014.
3. During the process of bidding procurement agency clearly inform to the potential bidder that they should quote single solution "Copy of e-mail attached".
4. Base on above clarification, we submit our bid with TM-U295 which is specialized slip printer and I would like to inform you that NBP already using TM-U295 slip printer since 2012.
5. However, it's very shocking for us to know that procurement agency did not consider our request and even they don't give us opportunity to plead our case basis on facts.
6. Procurement agency finalize ML-1120 which is only standard impact printer and not qualify in slip printer category due to various technical limitation, if you want to further verify our claim just use Google or any search engine with key word "Slip Printer"

We would like to further inform you that prices of standard impact printers are much lower than slip printers which we already quoted in our letter dated 10/11/2014 as attached. If NBP considers Epson standard impact printer (LX-310) it will save approximately Rs. 12 million with better specification & quality as compare to model ML-1120.

We request you to kindly re-evaluate tender results & give us opportunity to clarify any point which may lead to secure losses incurred on NBP by buying inappropriate products at very high price.

Regards,

Muhammad Ahmer

Sr. Manager Sales (South & Lahore) | mahmer@abmds.net | 0300-8239397 |

Cc to : President National Bank of Pakistan / Chief Information officer NBP / PPRA

