

No. F. 1(110)/DD-II/PPRA/2011  
GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN  
PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY  
(CABINET DIVISION)  
<><><>

Islamabad, the October 28, 2011.

SUBJECT: REPAIR OF PNSC TANKERS LAHORE AND QUETTA.

Reference Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Letter No. Nil  
Dated 13.10.2011 on the subject cited above.

2. Your request was forwarded to Pakistan National Shipping Corporation (PNSC) for disposal under Rules – 48 of PP Rules, 2004. Procuring Agency has given the comments on the request and the same is being enclosed for your kind perusal.

  
( Naeem Ahmed )  
Deputy Director-II

**Syed Adil Gilani,**  
Advisor,  
Transparency International- Pakistan,  
5 C, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor,  
Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase VII,  
DHA,  
KARACHI

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ



# Pakistan National Shipping Corporation

(ESTABLISHED UNDER ORDINANCE NO. XX OF 1979)

MRD/18787

October 27, 2011

Mr. Naeem Ahmed  
Deputy Director - II  
Public Procurement Regulatory Authority  
Cabinet Division  
Government of Pakistan  
Islamabad

**Subject : REPAIR OF PNSC TANKERS LAHORE AND QUETTA**

Dear Sir,

We refer to your letter No. F.1(110) DD-II/PPRA/2011 dated 13<sup>th</sup> October 2011, regarding Complain of Mr. M. Masood Butt. Director M/s. Power Ware, 109-B, Allama Shibli Nomani Road, Bath Island, Gulshan Faisal, Karachi.

Please note following with regards to afloat repair tenders of PNSC tankers Lahore and Quetta:-

1. The enquiry was floated on PPRA/PNSC website and News Papers on 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011 with cut off date 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2011 (Noon). Complete tenders details alongwith address and telephone No. for Correspondence was given in the advertisement.
2. On 9<sup>th</sup> September 2011 an e-mail was received to a wrong e-mail identity addressing Chairman PNSC and asking about the schedule and nature of work.
3. The e-mail was forwarded to our department on the same date and we immediately contacted Mr. Masood Butt to guide him properly.
4. Mr. Masood Butt was unable to download the repair specification files through provided web link. He under our guidance managed to down load the repair specification and confirmed on telephone. Mr. Masood Butt asked a number of irrelevant/unethical questions regarding allocated budget for repairs, ways and means to win the contract, etc. This request was declined politely and he was asked to submit his quotation by 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2011.
5. On 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2011 we once again received a phone call from Mr. Masood Butt, asking about the receipt of his bid. He was told that the bid from Jurong

P.N.S.C. BUILDING, MOULVI TAMIZUDDIN KHAN ROAD, KARACHI, PAKISTAN.  
PHONE : 9203980-99 (20 LINES) FAX: 9203974 - 5636658  
E-mail : communication@pns.com.pk.



بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ



# Pakistan National Shipping Corporation

(ESTABLISHED UNDER ORDINANCE NO. XX OF 1979)

Shipyards Singapore has not been received. He asked about other bids, their quoted amount etc. This question was declined and he was clearly informed that we can not disclose bids of one participant to others. He requested that his e-mail system is out of order and once we receive the bid from Jurong Shipyards we should confirm receipt. His request was agreed in good faith and after receipt of bids from Jurong Shipyards he was informed. During that call he requested for a meeting, he was refused and told that we cannot meet for any unethical support and the tenders from 5 different yards of world will be evaluated in 8-10 days. He was further informed that we can not have a meeting during this process and if any clarification is required that will be done on official e-mail of bidder to keep the record straight.

6. The tender was evaluated by 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2011 and a Large Expenditure Committee meeting headed by Chairman PNSC and attended by Executive Director (Ship Management), Executive Director (Commercial), Executive Director (Finance), Company Secretary, Chief Internal Auditor and other related officers.
7. During this meeting the comparative packages were discussed in detailed and contract was awarded to M/s. ASRY Shipyards Bahrain being lowest bidder in all respect.
8. It is PNSC policy that the results of all tenders to be posted on PPRA website as per PPRA rule No. 35. The same instruction were also given regarding this tender, However inadvertently staff missed out posting of results related to this tender which has now posted on PPRA website with regrets.

We assure you that in future all efforts will be made not to repeat such mistakes again.

Thanking you,

Yours faithfully  
For Pakistan National Shipping Corporation

IRFAN MAHMOOD  
MANAGER TECHNICAL TANKERS  
Maintenance Repair and Spares Department

2

P.N.S.C. BUILDING, MOULVI TAMIZUDDIN KHAN ROAD, KARACHI, PAKISTAN.  
PHONE : 9203980-99 (20 LINES) FAX: 9203974 - 5636658  
E-mail : communication@pnsc.com.pk.

**Irfan Mahmood**

**From:** "Sultan Khan" <sultan.khan@pnscl.com.pk>  
**To:** <info@ppra.or.pk>  
**Cc:** "Zahid Hussain" <zahid@pnscl.com.pk>; "Irfan Mahmood Shaikh" <irfanmahmood@pnscl.com.pk>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 26, 2011 12:09 PM  
**Attach:** AWARD OF CONTRACT REPAIRS LAHORE.doc  
**Subject:** Evaluation Result, Regarding "Afloat Repairs Of Crude Oil Tanker (M.T. LAHORE)"

DEAR, SIR,

PLEASE FIND ATTACHED HEREWITH TENDER No. (2082011-L) **EVALUATION RESULT**, REGARDING "AFLOAT REPAIRS OF CRUDE OIL TANKER (M.T. LAHORE)".

BEST REGARDS,

**SULTAN KHAN**

ASST. MANAGER (PROCUREMENT)

PAKISTAN NATIONAL SHIPPING CORP.

MOBILE : +92 332-7879990  
PHONE : (92 21) 99203980-99 (EXT. 390)  
FAX : (92 21) 99203974 35636658  
E-MAIL : SULTAN.KHAN@PNSCL.COM.PK

10/27/2011