

5-C, 2nd Floor, Khayaban-e-Ittehad, Phase VII, Defence Housing Authority, Karachi. Tel: (92-21)-35390408, 35390409, Fax: 35390410

E-mail: ti.pakistan@gmail.com Website: www.transparency.org.pk

8th April 2013

Mr. Yaseen Anwar, Governor, State Bank of Pakistan, I.I. Chundrigar Road, Karachi.

Sub: Objection on NBP's purchase of over 70 acres land from Mr Daryus. T Sethna to be adjusted against loan as Notified in JANG of 8th April 2013

Dear Sir,

TI Pakistan refers to the Public Notice published in Jang of 8 April 2013, inviting objections on NBP's purchase of over 70 acres land from Mr Daryus T Sethna to be adjusted against a loan. NBP is not allowed to purchase land without following Public Procurement Rules 2004 and the valuation of the land must be determined from the public auction, in order to safeguard Exchequer Money.

If valuation is conducted by Banks approved Valuators, the experience of such valuation has been poor. A few of them approved 2 to 7 times the market value, as has been in the case of NICL purchases of land in Karachi Bagh Korangi, in which case 10 acres were valued at Rs 900 million against the market value of Rs 450 million. In the valuation of land in Lahore, 805 Kanal was valued at 7 time more than market value causing loss of over Rs 1.45 billion. M/S Tri Star, M/S Medallion Services and M/S Consultancy Support Services were the approved valuators in these cases. These lands were procured in the violation of law and the difference or full amount has been refunded by the parties: Reference Suo-Moto Case No. 18 of 2010, and over Rs. 3 billion have so far been recovered by the Supreme Court of Pakistan.

If under some influence the value of this property is determined at less than the market value, and then the bank sells it to that influential person at that very value, it will be depriving the account holder benefit of his real value, which is a fraud and cheating. There are examples of such previous deals reported in press in past.

TIP request the Governor SBP not to allow NBP to buy this property, and sell it through open public auction and that amount adjusted against the outstanding loan.

NBP since last 1-1/2 years has failed to legally justify the case of purchase of 15,406 Sq. Yds. Plot No. LA-2/B from Afroze Textile Industries (Pvt.) Limited; Refer TIP Letters dated 23^{rd} January 2012, 09^{th} February and 29^{th} February 2012 and PPRA Letter dated 25^{th} January 2012.

It is true that under Section 7 of the Banking Companies Ordinance 1962, NBP may be authorized to acquire the property and adjust the customer's liability, but at what value. The value of the property mortgaged in previous times maybe higher or lower than the present market value and therefore the law of Pakistan binds NBP to sell / auction the property and adjust the value towards the liability of the customer.



If all the loans by Banks were fully secured by keeping collaterals of assets, and valuation of those assets were correct, then why over Rs. 200 Billion in previous years have been lost, and why one big business group is defaulting over Rs 60 billion loans of various banks in Pakistan, and SBP as regulators is silent.

TI-P requests the Governor to kindly review the SBP clarification and issue a clear cut order for NBP to auction the property publically as was rightly done in 2012 by the Askari Bank in case of 13842 sq. yds. and 10648 Sq. Yds. industrial plot in S.I.T.E.

With Regards,

Syed Adil Gilani

Adviser

Copies forwarded for the information and action under their mandatory responsibilities to:

- PSPM, Prime Minsters House, Islamabad.
- 2. Chairman, NAB, Islamabad.
- 3. Registrar, Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Auditor General, Islamabad.
- 5. President, NBP, Karachi.
- Managing Director, PPRA, Islamabad
- 7. Directors SBP, Mr Hidayatullah and Mr Mahamood Mandiwala, Karachi



KAIKHUSRO RUSTOM IRANI كِتَا نُونِي ورثاءاورعوام الناس كيليّ

المراموكل نيشنل بينك آف ياكستان ، Mr. DARAYUS T. SETHNA كي ايك غير منقوله الملاك حامل سروے نمبرز96 (08-08 ايكزز)،97 (37-75 ا يكزز)،98(20-10 يكزز)،99(99-10 يكزز)،100(26-26 گمنزاز) 101(77-00 گنٹاز)، 102 (33-00 گنٹاز)، 103 (11-07 ایکژز)، 104 (40-06 ایکژز)، 105 (01-501 يكڙز) 106 (18-00 گنٹاز)، 107 (00-01 يكڙز)، 108 (88-04 ايكڙز) 109 (21-00 گفتاز) 110 (04-01 گفتاز) يمانشي 70 ايكوز، 36 گفتاز ديب Gangiaro ٹیو لانڈھی ضلع ملیر کراچی ("الملاک") جو اس نے Gangiaro RUSTOM IRANI (آنجمانی) ہے ان کی وصیت کے ایگزیکیوٹرز کے توسط ہے بذر بعدایک با قاعدہ رجٹر ڈسیل ڈیٹر حاصل کیتھی کوقبول کرنے کاارادہ رکھتا ہے۔

KAIKHUSRO RUSTOM IRANI کے کوئی قانونی ورثاء ماان کی وصیت کا بینیفشری یا کوئی شخص مالیاتی اداره سرکاری اتھارٹی جس کو مذکوره املاک پرنیشتل بینک آف پاکتان کارئن پیدا کرنے یا Mr. DARAYUS T. SETHNA کی ملکت ہونے یر کوئی اعتراض ہوتو اس سے نوٹس ہذا کی اشاعت سے اندرون 3 یوم پیشل بینک آف یا کستان یا سب رجسٹرار بن قاسم ٹاؤن یا مندرجہ ذیل ایڈووکیٹ سے رابطہ کرے جس کے بعد کوگی دعویٰ/ اعتراض جوبھی ہوقبول نہیں کیا جائے گا اور بعدا زاں ایسے مخص جواملاک پر کوئی حق یا دعویٰ رکھتا ہوکو کوئی اعتراض اٹھانے کی اجازت نہیں ہوگی۔

AHMED & QAZI

Advocates & Corporate Legal Consultants 403-404, 417 & 4th Clifton Centre, Clifton, Karachi.

UAN: 021-111-000-073 Fax: 021 35860428 Email: law@ahmedandgazi.com

Web: www.ahmedandgazi.com